

Arlington Historic District Commissions

December 19, 2013
Whittemore Robbins House

FINAL & APPROVED MINUTES

Commissioners Present: D. Baldwin, C. Barry, J. Cummings, C. Hamilton, S. Makowka, J. Nyberg, M. Penzenik, J. Worden

Commissioners Not Present: J. Black, M. Bush, B. Cohen, M. Logan

Guests: B. Eykamp, D. Garrity, R. Botterio, M. Noonan

1. **AHDC Meeting Opens** 8:00pm
2. **Appointment of alternate Commissioners: Pleasant Street – C. Barry, J. Cummings, C. Hamilton, S. Makowka**
3. **Approval of draft minutes from November 21, 2013 meetings.** S. Makowka asked for clarification on accuracy of J. Worden vote on skylight in the minutes. J. Worden said he didn't feel that strongly about the skylight so he did go along with the majority and did not abstain as reflected correctly in the minutes. D. Baldwin moved approval, seconded by J. Nyberg. Unanimous approval.
4. **Communications**
 - a. Emails and phone calls re: 33 Westminster Ave. from potential buyer – M. Bush talked with him about AHDC jurisdiction and procedures. Suggested he come in for informal but no further communication
 - b. Phone call re: demolition process (referred to AHC)
 - c. Email from M. Bouton re: 17 Irving Street (Parmenter) for update on fence removal and status of request for new fence
5. **New Business**

Hearings (typically last around 20 minutes per application) 8:20pm

 1. **Continuation of Formal Hearing re: 17 Irving Street** (Town of Arl.) for removal of non-compliant fence and installation of appropriate fence. -- Applicant sent email that they do not plan to continue forward with a new fence at this time and understand they will receive a procedural denial. They plan to come in with a new application in the spring. J. Worden moved denial of application for a new fence for 17 Irving, seconded by J. Nyberg. Votes: J. Worden -- yes for denial, J. Cummings, J. Nyberg yes, S. Makowka -- yes, C. Barry -- yes, C. Hamilton -- yes, D. Baldwin -- yes, M. Penzenik - yes.
 2. **Formal Hearing re: 247 Pleasant Street (aka Lot 47)** re: changes in original approved plans for new construction. M. Noonan (representing owner) and S. Artley (architect) attended to answer questions. Architect stated that owner P. Noonan asked

him to do actual working drawings for the project. When he started working on the project, he told the owner that existing drawings were not buildable as approved by the AHDC. He has suggested a number of changes in order to make the plan structurally viable and to modify interior lay out to optimize the inside space. He tried to keep essence of the approved design on the outside by making it resemble what was approved. After he executed to a certain point, he talked with J. Nyberg about the changes and has added some information to the plans as he understood was requested by the Commissioners. S. Makowka explained that while the Commission appreciated the additional information, the Commission felt that there was still some confusion and uncertainty about the materials, the massing, and the revised design leading to a request that the owner and the architect be here tonight to answer questions.

S. Makowka suggested starting with the front façade. He noted that the chimney was originally drawn in a more Tudor style rather than the simple square chimney shown in the current plan. Also, the garage doors as shown as 3 section doors as opposed to 4 section doors as originally approved. M. Penzenik stated that Commission's preference is to have carriage style doors not look like typical roll up garage door.

M. Penzenik suggested changes to certain framing elements as shown on the plan. For example, the really narrow strip of clapboards next to the window on the front doesn't help the design. Also, 2nd floor of the floorplan there is a window hard in the corner but it is not shown that way in the elevation. Also, roof skirt or overhang in front appears to be a problem. Finally, it was noted that the front door was not centered in the entrance space. The architect said he wants to put a window seat. M. Penzenik suggested a big wall sconce on outside to balance the composition.

J. Worden asked about the width of the building. Response: dimensions are the same as originally approved – width 38 feet, length 46 feet with 4 foot dining room bay. Are kitchen windows in left side elevation shown as counter height? Response: yes they are according to architect. Discussion about two windows on rear elevation and alignment issues. J. Worden said windows in a Tudor house do not always line up. Architect added that the two windows discussed are not on the same plane.

D. Baldwin asked about the changes in the rear corner. S. Artley responded that the kitchen windows are on the far right hand side now. The changes were made because the original design had a big skirt that restricted the amount of light coming into the kitchen as well as to side of bump-out where dining table is located. He also presented an additional suggested modification as an option that has a roof just over the bay that creates a porch instead of running all the way across. J. Cummings said the suggested option is not as heavy. M. Penzenik commented 1) should bump-out be deeper (out further), since it is not much of a porch. Answer – it's really just a covered landing. It was suggested that the house could benefit from having this landing come out further so that the dining room alcove is larger. 2) Pull out roof overhang to be equal and put a bracket back into drawings. C. Barry asked if considered French doors instead of sliders. Response - they will take look at that option. S. Makowka asked about steps across entire of width in the original plans that are partially removed in the current plans – now have clapboards that go down to foundation – should there be a water-table or something to anchor the building?.

M. Penzenik asked if they might be open to fewer, less complex mix of materials. She stated that what characterizes a Tudor revival is brick on 1st floor and stucco on second floor with half timbering. She suggested some changes to create a

cohesiveness of the materials? S. Makowka said house next door has strong turret with brick and most of the rest of house is clapboard. This is picking up those design elements. J. Nyberg said he has done a recent stucco house and it's not like the old stucco. Almost feels more plastic than cement. C. Hamilton asked if chimney as proposed is big enough. Commissioners said they want the "Tudor style" chimney as approved in the final decision (see 3/7 plans). S. Artley stated that rear chimney placement would be functional due to interior fireplace location but not really viewable from exterior. S. Makowka suggested putting on two chimneys – one functional to the rear and one Tudor style faux in the front. J. Worden asked about the steps in back.

In response to a question about materials, S. Makowka said that plans should adhere to the approved plans which were consisted with Commissions' guidelines – i.e., no Azek trim (must be wood), chimney being put back in, siding wood clapboard not Hardee plank (which was specifically noted in certificate), windows, doors, trim to be wood, not clad Azek trim. Simulated divided light windows are ok in this situation due to new construction. Gutters to be wood, copper or commission approved alternative (such as the Fiberglass Gutter company), foundation covered in appropriate material, not bare concrete, final material specifications to be approved by monitor prior to installation. M. Penzenik asked about the specifications of the brick shown on the plan Response: will use actual brick, not Brickmaster faux bricks. C. Barry said bricks on tudor style would be fired clay irregular brick clinkers. Vermont Brick makes these types of bricks. M. Penzenik said she thinks they should limit brick to 1st floor. It will be brutal to cut every brick edge on an angle to install along the gables -- continuing stucco up there makes more sense. One way to retain brick concept is to lay it around the bottom on all sides. J. Worden said we already approved the 3 sides as clapboard and the time for dealing with that was at initial hearings. Now isn't really fair to demand so many changes such as brick on sides – there has to be a sense of finality. D. Baldwin said the changes are so different that it does give us some leeway for changes. After discussion, Commissioners suggested that trim elements around window be retained, but that the second floor could be stucco. Maybe even stucco around the front door instead of clapboards, then try to emphasize brick element as appropriate on first floor by maybe adding brick around the garage door with brick coming up to bottom of windows. M. Penzenik asked for any revised drawings to reflect the footprint of the proposed porches.

S. Makowka briefly summarized Commission feedback as stucco on second floor, brick vertical on front floor, redo garage door, windows tweaked to corners, okay with proposed rear elevation changes. He feels that these changes get us 99% ready to go but thinks we need to see one more reiteration of plans next month to be sure we're all on the same page. Hearing continued to next month per applicant.

DOCUMENTATION SUBMITTED: DRAWINGS, EMAILS

3. **Informal Hearing re: 39 Russell Street (Walsh) for addition.** R. Botterio gave presentation. He stated that he recently sold the house and that the new owners asked him to prepare plans to convert the existing house from a 2 family and restore it back to single family while creating something to give each new owner their own space. The thought is to make an addition to house while trying to make it work on the property and not look as big as the existing house. He stated that the addition as proposed is situated such that one could hardly see it from Russell Street. J. Worden said the second building as shown is attached by a kind of breezeway which is not legal according to the approved bylaws. He also feels the addition is not complementary to the existing house. R. Botterio said he tried to use elements on the addition that are currently on the original house, such as the front door and the

brackets that hold the roof over front door. He feels these elements make this addition Italianate like the original house. He also wanted to make it less visible from Russell Street by using a flat roof instead of a larger more visible gable. He asked for clarification is this is even a visible structure subject to a public view. S. Makowka suggested that plans show it is visible from Russell and is most likely visible from Water Street, and it will be visible at a distance from Summer Street.

J. Cummings said proportions, scale and massing are beautiful, but given that it is viewable from several vantage points, need to be sure that elements would be in keeping with original from all the angles. Over all the way the structures are laid out it creates this beautiful space. The roofline either way works, but she thinks you need to do what is the right thing for the structure. D. Baldwin felt that the plan looks very modern and he is hard pressed to see how it looks Italianate. Maybe some pitched roof would make him feel better but something isn't jiving. M. Penzenik said maybe it's the windows – there is too much glass. S. Makowka said that new construction in a district is a big deal. The context is this is one parcel and a significant change so we need to take the time to fully vet the proposal. S. Makowka said he is concerned about the massing.

6. Other Business

- a. Preservation Loan Program Update
- b. Outreach to Neighborhoods & Realtor
- c. Update of Project List by Commissioners
- d. Discussion regarding Draft Streetscape Recommendations by J. Cummings and D. Baldwin to Master Plan committee
- e. Discussion on date for AHDC/AHC joint meeting in 2013

7. OPEN FORUM

Any matter presented for consideration of the Commission shall neither be acted upon, nor a formal decision made the night of the presentation

8. REVIEW OF PROJECTS (See project list below)

Project List:

1. 23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. – 10-13P) – Makowka – CONA (Door)
2. 215 Pleasant Street (Gruber – 10-15P) – Penzenik – COA (Garage Door)
3. 193 Westminster (Pemsler - 10-21M) – Cohen – COA (Windows, Siding)
4. 10 Jason Street (Young-Sullivan – 10-32J) – Cohen – COA (Chimney-Skylite)
5. 193 Westminster Ave. (Pemsler – 10-41M) – Cohen – COA (Siding Removal-Clapboard-Windows)
6. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 10-49M) – Makowka – COA (Door)
7. 14 Westmoreland Ave. (Leveille – 10-51M) – Cohen – COA (Siding-Attic Windows)
8. 12 Elder Terrace (Folkers – 10-53M) – Cohen – COA (Garage)
9. 188-190 Westminster Ave. (Kokubo – 11-08M) – Penzenik – COA (Addition-Windows)
10. 69 Crescent Hill Ave. (Bush-Sheldon – 11-13M) – Nyberg – COA (Shingles/Clapboard)
11. 44 Academy Street (Gevalt/Bachrach -11-21P) – Penzenik – COA (Shed)
12. 21 Montague Street (Elwell/Nemec – 11-25M) – Makowka – CONA (Fascia-Porch-Rail)
13. 19 Jason Street (Dargon-Green – 11-40J) – Cohen – COA (Rear Deck-Stairway-Rails on Front)
14. 111 Pleasant Street (Frideau – 11-49) – Nyberg – COA (Fence)
15. 161 Westminster Ave. (Lancelotta – 11-50M) – Black – COA (Gutters)
16. 30-32 Jason Street (Harris/Charest – 12-08J) – Makowka – CONA (Porch Repair)

17. 15-15A Avon Place (Burke – 12-10A) – Black/Nyberg – COA (Main House/Garage Demo/Carriage House Build)
18. 19 Maple Street (Hirani – 12-14P) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters)
19. 734 Mass. Ave. (Davidson – 12-17J) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
20. 214R Pleasant Street (Bisher-Bernstein – 12-22P) Penzenik - COA (House Redesign)
21. 66 Pleasant Street (Fraumeni – 12-30P) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters/Downspouts)
22. 10 Avon Place (Gnewuck – 12-31A) – Makowka – CONA (Shingles)
23. 11 Wellington Street (Herold – 12-36P) – Makowka – CONA (Fence)
24. 10 Avon Place (Gnewuck – 12-37A) – Cohen – COA (Railing)
25. 23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. – 12-38P) – Makowka – COA (Porches-Entry-Fire Esc)
26. 156 Pleasant Street (Seitz – 12-39P) – Penzenik – COA (Windows)
27. 47 Irving Street (Kaplan – 12-40J) Cohen – COA (House Addition)
28. 60 Pleasant Street (Brentwood – 12-44P) – Makowka – CONA (Sliding Doors)
- 29.
30. 60 Pleasant Street (Brentwood – 12-49P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
31. 119 Pleasant Street (Poulos Trust – 12-53P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
32. 30 Jason Street (Harris/Charest – 12-52J) – Nyberg – COA (Porches)
33. 195 Westminster Ave. (Rothstein – 13-01M) – Cohen – COA (Skylights/Tube)
34. 81 Westminster Ave. (Lemire – 13-02M) – Makowka – CONA (Door)
35. 55 Westminster Ave. (Maier/Ching – 13-04M) – Cohen – COA (Windows)
36. 21 Central Street (Dyer – 13-05C) – Cohen – COA (Solar Panels)
37. 75 Pleasant Street (Bos. Church of Christ – 13-07P) – Makowka/Cohen – COA (Annex Renovations/Church Restorations)
38. Lot 47 (aka 247 Pleasant Street- 13-08P) – Nyberg – COA (new house)
39. 204 Pleasant Street (Sirah RT – 13-10P) – Penzenik – COA (Cupola/Windows)
40. 86 Pleasant Street (Coyner – 13-16P) – Makowka – CONA (chimney repair)
41. 7 Jason Terrace (Fredieu – Historical Society – 13-22J) – Makowka – CONA (roof)
42. 15 Wellington Street (Cohen – 13-28P) – Makowka – COA (gutters/fascia/soffits)
43. 208 Pleasant Street (Hart – 13-29P) – Makowka – COA (solar panels)
44. 210 Pleasant Street (Hart – 13-30P) – Makowka – COA (solar panels)
45. 33 Gray Street (Lubar – 13-35J) – Makowka (CONA (stairs and deck)
46. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 13-38M) – Makowka – CONA (siding)
47. 24 Avon Place (Sayigh – 13-41A) – Makowka – CONA (windows)
48. 109 Westminster Ave. (Rines-Pascale – 13-46M) – Barry – COA (garage)
49. 23 Jason Street (Leary-Hammerman – 13-47J) – Cohen – COA (addition)
50. 161 Westminster Ave. (Lancelotta – 13-48M) – Makowka – COA (fence)
51. 15 Oak Knoll (Lo – 13-52P) – Makowka – CONA (windows, doors)
52. 49 Academy Street (Baldwin – 13-53P) – Worden – COA (steps)
53. 31 Central Street (Sampson/Cummings – 13-54C) – Makowka – COA (addition)
54. 211 Pleasant St. (Stark-McElduff – 13-58P) – Makowka – CONA (roof)
55. 175 Pleasant St. (Lucchese – 13-59P) – Barry – COA (repairs)
56. 10 Central Street (Hedlune – 13-60C) – Baldwin – COA (solar panels)
57. 37 Jason Street (Lees – 13-61J) – Makowka – DENIAL (solar panels)
58. 272 Broadway (Danieli/Crispin – 13-62B) – Makowka – COA (dormer)
59. 216 Pleasant St. (Russell – 13-63P – Bush – COA (soffit vent)
60. 239 Pleasant Street (McKinnon – 13-64P) – Cummings – 10 day COA (wall)
61. 24 Central Street (Donelly/Fisher – 13-65C) – Makowka – CONA (porch/steps)
62. 114 Westminster Ave. (Metzger/Fleming – 13-66M) – Makowka – CONA (fence)
63. 7 Central Street (Sampson – 13-67C) – Makowka – CONA (solar panels)
64. 239 Pleasant Street (McKinnon – 13-68P) – Cummings – COA (stairway/wall/fence/rail)
65. 34 Academy Street (Ellison – 13-69P) – Penzenik – COA (windows, doors, deck)
66. 152 Pleasant Street (Niles – 13-70P) – Bush – COA (gutters)
67. 21 Maple Street K(Theosophical Society – 13-71P) – Makowka – CONA (gutters/fascia)

- 68. 19 Wellington Street (Kirchheimer – 13-72P) – Makowka – CONA (windows)
- 69. 20 Russell Street (Martin/Briggs – 13-75R) – Makowka – CONA (gutters)

Meeting Adjourned 10:25pm